

BARBICAN RESIDENTIAL COMMITTEE
Monday, 4 June 2018

Minutes of the meeting of the Barbican Residential Committee held at Guildhall
on Monday, 4 June 2018 at 1.45 pm

Present

Members:

Randall Anderson
Matthew Bell*
Chris Boden*
Mark Bostock
Deputy David Bradshaw
Mary Durcan
Ann Holmes*
Michael Hudson*
Jeremy Mayhew*
Deputy Joyce Nash (in the Chair until item 6)
Barbara Newman
Susan Pearson*
William Pimlott
Stephen Quilter
Deputy John Tomlinson

**non-resident members*

Officers:

Mark Jarvis	- Chamberlains
Michael Bradley	- City Surveyor's Department
Alan Bennetts	- Comptroller and City Solicitor's
Chandni Tanna	- Communications
Helen Davinson	- Community and Children's Services
Michael Bennett	- Community and Children's Services
Mike Saunders	- Community and Children's Services
Anne Mason	- Community and Children's Services
Paul Murtagh	- Community and Children's Services
Julie Mayer	- Town Clerk's Department

1. APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from Graham Packham and Rehana Ameer.

2. MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

The Town Clerk reminded those Members who had been granted dispensations to speak at today's meeting, as follows:

Mark Bostock	Granted (speaking rights only) – (Standards Committee) <i>**under delegated authority (SO 41(b))</i>	18/05/18	A dispensation be granted to speak only on Ben Jonson, Breton, Thomas More, Benyon and Willoughby Houses, Barbican residential car park and <i>stores</i> ** at the Barbican Residential Committee on 4 June 2018.
Deputy John Tomlinson	Granted (speaking rights only) (Standards Committee)	18/05/18	A dispensation be granted to speak only at Barbican Residential Committee on 4 June 2018 on car park charges and stores.
Deputy David Bradshaw	Granted (speaking rights only until 4 June 18) (Standards Committee)	18/05/18	A dispensation be granted to speak only on Baggage stores in the Barbican at the Barbican Residential Committee on 4 June 2018.
William Pimlott	Granted (Standards Committee under delegated authority (SO 41(b)))	31/5/18	A dispensation be granted to speak only on Ben Jonson, Breton, Thomas More, Benyon and Willoughby Houses, Barbican residential car park and stores at the Barbican Residential Committee on 4 June 2018.
Mary Durcan	Granted (Standards Committee under delegated authority (SO 41(b)))	31/5/18	A dispensation be granted to speak only on Ben Jonson, Breton, Thomas More, Benyon and Willoughby Houses, Barbican residential car park and stores at the Barbican Residential Committee on 4 June 2018.

Mrs Newman and Mrs Nash, both resident members, had been advised not to apply for dispensations, in respect of car park charges, as they were not car owners and had no intention of becoming one in the future.

Members were also reminded of the importance of submitting timely applications, which were neither too wide nor vague, and the Chairman suggested that Members work together, across the two wards, to ensure consistent applications, which were more likely to be granted. A Member, who is also a Member of the Standards Committee, suggested that the bureaucracy could be simpler and the timespan between Members receiving reports and the date of the Committee could be unhelpful. He had raised this matter with the Chairman of the Standards Committee and, in the interim, Members were advised to speak to the Monitoring Officer if they were unclear.

3. **MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING**

RESOLVED, that - the public minutes and non-public summary of the meeting held on 19th March 2018 be approved.

4. **ORDER OF THE COURT**

Members received the Order of the Court of Common Council dated 19 April 2018.

RESOLVED, that – the order of the Court dated 19 April 2018 be approved.

5. **TO ELECT A CHAIRMAN IN ACCORDANCE WITH STANDING ORDER 29**

The Committee elected a Chairman in accordance with Standing Order 29.

RESOLVED, That – being the only Member willing to serve, Mr Michael Hudson be elected as Chairman of the Barbican Residential Committee for 2018/19.

It was moved by Deputy Joyce Nash, seconded by Randall Anderson and RESOLVED UNANIMOUSLY, that -

Members of the Barbican Residential Committee wish to place on record their sincere appreciation to ANN HOLMES for her committed, enthusiastic and good-humoured way she has chaired their Committee since 2016.

Under Ann's Chairmanship, the residents' working party network has strengthened to include a new Electric Vehicle Charging Working Party, including a successful launch event in May and a Car Park Charges Working Party.

In order to improve both the quality of life and safety of residents; Ann's Chairmanship has overseen a new Fire Safety Policy, following the tragic Grenfell Fire in June 2017 and new access arrangements for emergency services entering the Estate. Concrete testing and surveys to the tower and terrace blocks have completed, along with repairs to roofs and guttering, and an historic issue in respect of roof warranties is close to resolution. A new Lease Enforcement Policy is in place which, as a result of Ann's commitment to thorough consultation, aims to deliver a fair but flexible approach to an emotive and complex matter.

Looking to the future, and from a corporate perspective; the Committee is currently deliberating options to achieve additional car park/storage income for 2018/19, as part the City Corporation's service-based review targets. This has been another highly emotive and contentious area of Policy and, again, Ann has worked diligently with officers and the Car Park Charges Working Party, to ensure a measured and fair outcome.

Finally, the Committee wishes to place on record its recognition of Ann's dedication to the Barbican Residential Committee and the Estate's residents, along with her exemplary work ethic and affable nature. Her colleagues would like to convey their gratitude and best wishes for the future.

6. **TO ELECT A DEPUTY CHAIRMAN IN ACCORDANCE WITH STANDING ORDER 30**

The Committee elected a Deputy Chairman in accordance with Standing Order 30.

RESOLVED, That – being the only Member willing to serve, Ms Susan Pearson be elected as Deputy Chairman of the Barbican Residential Committee for 2018/19.

7. MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE BARBICAN RESIDENTS CONSULTATION COMMITTEE (BRCC)

Members received the draft minutes of the Barbican Residents Consultation Committee of 21 May 2018.

8. CAR PARK CHARGING POLICY

Members considered a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services in respect of car park charges and stores on the Barbican Estate. Members noted that there had been extensive communications from residents in this matter, including an alternative proposal from one of the House Groups, which had been supported by the RCC when it met on 21st May. Since the meeting of the RCC, the City Solicitor had provided legal responses to some of the questions raised at the RCC's meeting on 21st May and these had been circulated to RCC and BRC Members ahead of that day's meeting.

The Chairman opened the debate by asking Members as to whether or not they wanted to consider car park and storage either together, or as separate items, and the consensus was for them to be taken together.

During the discussion and debate the following points were noted and each Member, who had been granted a dispensation, was given the opportunity to speak:

1. Should the proposal before Members not go ahead, could Members take a decision in respect of the bigger stores, and some increase in respect of car park charges, to residents only, although by a lesser amount than that suggested in the report?
2. Could the Car Park Charges Working Party undertake a new study, including the proposals put forward by the RCC House Groups?
3. Could there be a longer-term approach, with a quick fix on short term problems, to assist those in small flats who are in need of storage?
4. The proposal appears to lack a consolidated financial analysis and might need more work; it was suggested that a 15% drop in demand might be underestimated.
5. Could the proposal be more creative, without the need for a large increase? Gradual increases are always more acceptable and Concierge allocation and stores need a more holistic approach.
6. If non-residents use baggage stores they would not have an assa key which would access private residential areas of the Estate. Officers advised access arrangements would be via a dual lock system; one would

be kept by the Concierge and one by the non-resident, as agreed by the Police and the Barbican Association Security Committee. Could charging for key porters be introduced?

7. Residents of the City are entitled to a considerable discount in City car parks and there was a concern about assumed elasticity of demand.
8. There should have been an Equalities Impact Assessment with the report and Members expressed concern for those residents with mobility issues who need to park their cars close to where they live. Could a reduced amount be introduced for residents with a disability?
9. The RCC had rejected the report before the BRC but there had been unanimous support for the Lauderdale Tower House Group proposal. House Groups had clearly given serious thought to producing logical arguments for scrutiny at the RCC.
10. There were concerns about the accuracy of data in respect of the number of car parks and vacancies. Whilst Members accepted that the car park deficit could not be sustained, they had concerns that commercial costs appeared to have been applied to a residential area.
11. The Girls School proposal and Culture Mile would impact on car parking spaces.
12. BRC Members would have liked more time to consider the extensive number of emails from residents over the previous week.
13. If the Stores application to the Planning and Transportation Committee had not been delayed, there would be a different set of figures before Members.
14. The Deputy Chairman is a resident of Golden Lane and paid more for car parking than Barbican residents.

Some Members spoke in support of the report and Officers responded, as follows:

15. There is a need to look at reapportioning service charges and, whilst not affecting the basis of this report, car park users effectively pay for the parking of other residents' visitors and contractors.
16. This report is based on the views of a Member/Officer Working Party, on which Members were in a majority. It was established a year ago as the BRC had no charging policy and needed one, and the remit of the Working Party was to look for a fair return for car parking and storage.
17. It is commonly accepted that a fair return is based on market values - the basis by which City Corporation rents are set. The City Corporation can

choose not to go to the maximum suggested by market valuations; as set out in the proposal before Members.

18. The only leaseholders with any entitlement to a parking or storage space in the car parks are those who have bought a lease on one. Other residents had no entitlement to the use of these spaces.
19. Policy and Resources Committee and the Court of Common Council can intervene in decisions which impact on a Committee's ability to balance its budget. If a facility fails to return a fair rent then it is possible that other uses could be found.
20. The City is densely occupied and has a very limited amount of land. As we move towards a City community, which is a mix of business, cultural and residential uses, is it prudent to leave tracts of land either underused or undercosted?
21. In response, the resident Members stressed that, notwithstanding their duty to the City and the Committee's role as a Landlord, they were also here to represent their constituents. Given that such a high number of residents are unhappy, then the Committee should consider an alternative.
22. Officers confirmed that the current stores Charging Policy expired in March 2018 and the current car parking Charging Policy expires in September 2018. Officers also confirmed that stores and car parking licence holders require three months notification to take effect and that this would have to be completed by 23 June to effect an increase for the September quarter.
23. The signing of the contract for the new stores has been delayed and if this is not done shortly then the works would have to be re-tendered.

It was then Proposed by Jeremy Mayhew, seconded by Matthew Bell and RESOLVED, that -

The Working Party convene a further meeting to consider the matter further and a Special Meeting of the BRC be convened, on the morning of Court, 21 June 2018 to take a decision.

9. **FIRE SAFETY UPDATE**

Members received a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services in respect of the work done on potential improvements to enhance the safety of the City of London Corporation's (CoLC's) Barbican Residential Estate and its residents in the event of fire.

When the report was considered by the Community and Children's Services Committee, Members were asked to consider the strategic direction the CoLC should take in its future approach to fire safety. Pending the decision taken at the meeting of the Community and Children's Services, Members noted that

there had been an expectation that the recommendations from Dame Judith Hackett's report would be different. The Assistant Director further explained that, since the cladding at Grenfell Tower had been unfit for purpose, there was no longer a retrospective requirement to fit sprinklers to Tower Blocks.

Members noted that fire testing of doors had taken place the previous Saturday, attended by some Members and officers, including RCC Members, and the Assistant Director advised that the test had gone well, with a combustion point of 36 minutes. Members also noted that the Fire Risk Assessments had not raised significant concerns on compartmentation.

RESOLVED, that – the report be noted.

10. **UPDATE REPORT**

Members received the Update report of the Director of Community and Children's Services. In respect of a query about the cost of the retrofitting of assa keys for Blake Towers, officers agreed to provide the cost of key fobs under the '*You Said; We Did*' outstanding actions report at the next meeting.

RESOLVED, that – the report be noted.

11. **SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENTS QUARTERLY REVIEW**

Members received the quarterly Service Level Agreement report of the Director of Community and Children's Services.

RESOLVED, that – the report be noted.

12. **PROGRESS OF SALES AND LETTINGS**

Members received the regular update on sales and lettings approved by officers, under delegated authority, since the last meeting of the Committee.

RESOLVED, that – the report be noted.

13. **QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**

A Member asked about the apparent increase in the theft of plants from Thomas More Garden, the Wildlife Garden and the residents' planter boxes on the highwalks. This had been upsetting for those residents, and those who enjoy the gardens, as well as disheartening for the gardening staff and volunteers. Furthermore, there would be cost implications to both residents and the BEO. The Members also asked if any action could be taken; i.e. notices or CCTV? The Chairman of the BA Security Committee; also a Member of this Committee, agreed to add this matter to the agenda for their next meeting.

14. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT**

There was none.

15. **EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC**

In respect of item 18 on today's agenda; i.e. 18 Brandon Mews, Members were reminded that the report was exempt under the 1972 Local Government Act as it contained information that could identify an individual and was commercially sensitive. Therefore, the Members of the public attending today's meeting would be required to leave for this item.

RESOLVED, that – Under Section 100 (a) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items, on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part 1 of Schedule 12 A of the Local Government Act.

Item No	Para No
18, 19	1, 2 & 3

At 3.40 pm, Members resolved to suspend Standing Order to complete the business on the agenda.

16. **NON-PUBLIC MINUTES**

RESOLVED, that – the non-public minutes of the meeting held on 19th March 2018 be approved.

17. **DRAFT MINUTES OF THE CAR PARK CHARGES WORKING PARTY**

The draft minutes of the Car Park Charging Working Party were received.

18. **BRANDON MEWS LEASE VARIATION**

Members considered and approved a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services.

19. **ARREARS UPDATE**

Members received a report of the Director of Community and Children's Services.

20. **NON-PUBLIC QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**

There were no questions.

21. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREES SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED**

There were no items.

The meeting ended at 3.55 pm

Chairman

Contact Officer: Julie Mayer

tel.no.: 020 7332 1410

Julie.Mayer@cityoflondon.gov.uk